



Shaping Balanced Minds: Exploring the Integration of Religious Moderation in Indonesian Elementary Education

Muchamad Fauyan¹; Anwar Efendi²; Sugeng Bayu Wahyono³;
Sugito Sugito⁴; Nur Kholis⁵

^{1,5}Universitas Islam Negeri K. H. Abdurrahman Wahid Pekalongan, Indonesia

^{2,3,4}Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia

¹Correspondence Email: muchamadfauyan.2022@student.uny.ac.id

Received: December 15, 2023

Accepted: January 14, 2026

Published: January 30, 2026

Article Url: <https://journal.scadindependent.org/index.php/jipeuradeun/article/view/1213>

Abstract

Religious moderation has become a strategic agenda in Indonesian education to strengthen social cohesion in pluralistic societies. At the primary education level, studies on religious moderation remain fragmented and require integrative synthesis. This study examines how religious moderation education is implemented in Indonesian elementary schools and Madrasah Ibtidaiyah (SD/MI) through a Systematic Literature Review retrieved from Google Scholar, Scopus, ScienceDirect, and Elicit.ai. The analysis focuses on conceptualization, pedagogical implementation, and reported challenges and impacts. The findings indicate that religious moderation education at the SD/MI level is predominantly implemented through integrative and implicit practices rather than as a standalone curricular subject. Moderation values – such as justice, tolerance, inclusivity, and social harmony – are embedded across curricula, learning materials, pedagogical strategies, and school culture, with teachers functioning as key mediators of value internalization. While moderation-oriented education contributes to more inclusive school climates and positive student attitudes toward diversity, its implementation remains uneven due to limited teacher conceptual clarity, competing academic demands, and the growing influence of digital environments. This study contributes by articulating embedded moderation pedagogy as a conceptual framework for understanding religious moderation education in early schooling. The findings provide a concise reference for advancing research, policy development, and educational practice in religious and character education within pluralistic contexts.

Keywords: Religious Moderation; Elementary Education; Madrasah Ibtidaiyah; Embedded Moderation Pedagogy.

A. Introduction

Religious moderation (*al-wasathiyah*) has increasingly emerged as a central pillar of educational policy in pluralistic societies, particularly in Indonesia, where it functions as a strategic instrument for maintaining social cohesion and harmony amid religious, cultural, and ethnic diversity (Mustakim et al., 2021). In contemporary global discourse, education is no longer viewed merely as a mechanism for knowledge transmission, but as a formative arena for cultivating inclusive identities, ethical citizenship, and social responsibility from an early age (Kamaludin et al., 2021; Amri et al., 2024; Rosmawati, 2025). Within this framework, religious moderation is not only a theological orientation but also a civic virtue essential to sustaining peaceful coexistence in multicultural societies.

In Indonesia, this vision has been institutionally reinforced through the synergy between the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Religious Affairs, which has formally embedded religious moderation as a foundation of character education within the national curriculum (Inayatillah et al., 2022; Syahbudin et al., 2023; Hasan & Mujahidin, 2023). The policy orientation seeks to address pressing social challenges such as extremism, bullying, intolerance, and symbolic violence by promoting values of balance, justice, inclusivity, and respect for diversity at all levels of education, including primary schooling. Elementary education is therefore expected to function as a preventive and formative space, shaping moral dispositions before exclusionary ideologies become entrenched.

However, empirical evidence indicates a persistent disconnection between policy ambitions and classroom practices at the elementary school and Madrasah Ibtidaiyah (SD/MI) levels. Primary-age students remain vulnerable to exclusive religious narratives, low socio-cultural literacy, and unfiltered digital exposure that often circulates intolerant or polarizing content (Burhanuddin & Khairuddin, 2022; Nurwahyuni & Tabrani ZA, 2025). Although curricular documents emphasize inclusivity, several studies report that the internalization of moderation values has not yet reached the deeper psychological and cognitive dimensions of children (Ridwan et al., 2022; Mulyana, 2023; Hasan & Mujahidin, 2023). Instances of symbolic violence, weak integration of local values, and superficial moral instruction suggest that moderation is frequently articulated normatively rather than embodied meaningfully in daily learning experiences (Masturin, 2023; Fadil et al., 2024).

Building on these empirical findings, the gap between policy aspirations and pedagogical realities can be understood as a structural and pedagogical challenge that extends beyond curriculum texts into teacher capacity, learning ecology, and instructional mediation. While national and institutional policies promote religious moderation as a foundational value, classroom enactment at the SD/MI level often lacks pedagogical depth and adaptive strategies aligned with children's developmental stages. Teachers tend to rely on moral narration, symbolic affirmation, and formal instruction, rather than dialogical, experiential, and reflective learning processes capable of engaging students' cognitive and affective dimensions more substantively (Ridwan et al., 2022; Mulyana, 2023; Hasan & Mujahidin, 2023). This condition is exacerbated by uneven teacher professional development, particularly in addressing socio-cultural diversity and digital exposure, which leaves young learners susceptible to exclusive narratives encountered outside formal schooling contexts (Burhanuddin & Khairuddin, 2022; Nurwahyuni & Tabrani ZA, 2025). Evidence from studies on distance-based and online professional training further suggests that without sustained, context-sensitive capacity building, teachers face significant constraints in translating normative policy discourse into meaningful classroom practice (Sharova et al., 2024; Mohiyeddini, 2024).

Moreover, broader mappings of religious moderation in Indonesian Islamic education reveal that implementation patterns remain fragmented and uneven, with stronger emphasis placed on policy alignment and institutional compliance than on transformative learning processes at the classroom level (Zamroni et al., 2025). At the level of school governance, principals play a strategic role in mediating moderation policies into instructional practice; however, empirical findings indicate that moderation initiatives are frequently embedded administratively through programs such as the Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Project, rather than pedagogically internalized through daily teaching and learning interactions (Rifki et al., 2024). As a result, moderation values often operate at a symbolic and performative level, reinforcing normative discourse without fostering internal reflection, moral reasoning, or socio-cultural sensitivity among students (Masturin, 2023; Fadil et al., 2024). Taken together, these findings underscore that strengthening religious moderation at the SD/MI level requires not only coherent policy frameworks but also sustained teacher development, culturally grounded pedagogy, and instructional leadership that prioritizes lived moral experience over curricular formalism.



Against this backdrop of persistent gaps between policy aspirations and classroom realities, scholarly attention to religious moderation in education has expanded considerably in recent years. Much of the existing literature seeks to respond to the limited internalization of moderation values by examining how such values are formally constructed and represented within educational systems. The current state of the art can be broadly grouped into three major strands. The first strand focuses on curricular and textbook analysis, examining how moderation values such as justice, tolerance, and global diversity are embedded within learning materials. Studies by Mulyana (2023) and Sadiyah et al. (2024), for instance, reveal that moderation values are often integrated implicitly in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) and Indonesian language textbooks, particularly at the upper elementary level. These works highlight the potential of curricular instruments as vehicles for moral and civic education, while also noting persistent inconsistencies between textual representations of moderation and their pedagogical enactment in classroom practice.

The second strand emphasizes pedagogical innovation to strengthen moderation education. This includes the use of digital Al-Qur'an literacy to counter intolerant narratives in online spaces (Maarif et al., 2024), the application of multicultural Problem-Based Learning models to foster empathy and cooperation (Rudianto et al., 2025), and the adoption of nature-based learning approaches that integrate environmental ethics with religious values (Silvi et al., 2025). These studies demonstrate that moderation can be cultivated through context-sensitive, learner-centered pedagogies rather than doctrinal instruction alone.

The third strand highlights the role of school culture and local wisdom in reinforcing moderation values. Research on interfaith artistic collaboration (Faridah et al., 2025) and the use of Madurese local values in moderation literacy (Sutrisno et al., 2025) illustrates how cultural traditions and community practices can function as a "hidden curriculum" that shapes students' attitudes toward diversity. Such findings underscore the importance of situating moderation education within students' lived social and cultural contexts.

Despite this growing body of literature, a significant research gap remains. Existing studies are largely fragmented, focusing on isolated aspects of curriculum, pedagogy, or school culture without offering a comprehensive synthesis that bridges policy-level value construction and classroom-level implementation at the SD/MI level.

Most literature reviews remain generalist, often encompassing secondary or higher education contexts, and thus overlook the unique developmental, pedagogical, and institutional dynamics of primary education. As a result, there is still no integrative thematic map that systematically explains how moderation values are translated from policy discourse into classroom strategies, how teachers mediate these values in practice, and what structural constraints shape implementation in elementary schools.

This study addresses this gap by offering a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) that exclusively synthesizes empirical research conducted between 2019 and 2025 on religious moderation education at the SD/MI level. Unlike previous reviews that primarily catalog research trends, this study develops a critical analytical framework that examines the interconnectedness of concepts, practices, and challenges across studies. The novelty of this research lies in its capacity to trace the evolution of moderation strategies—from traditional moral instruction and local wisdom to technology-based and pedagogical innovations—within a single, coherent synthesis focused on primary education.

Based on the identified gap, this study seeks to provide a systematic and integrative synthesis of empirical evidence on the implementation of religious moderation education in Indonesian elementary schools and *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* (SD/MI). The review examines how religious moderation is conceptually embedded in curricula and textbooks, operationalized through pedagogical practices and school-based strategies, and shaped by institutional, cultural, and technological contexts at the primary education level. By consolidating fragmented findings across recent studies, this research clarifies patterns of implementation, identifies recurring constraints and educational impacts, and maps the structural conditions that influence the effectiveness of moderation education in early schooling. The study is expected to make a conceptual contribution by strengthening the theoretical articulation of moderation pedagogy in primary education, while also providing practical insights for policymakers, curriculum developers, and educators in designing more contextually grounded, sustainable, and inclusive character education frameworks suited to pluralistic societies.

B. Method

This study employed a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) to synthesize empirical research on the integration of religious moderation education in Indonesian elementary schools, specifically within Sekolah Dasar (SD) and *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* (MI) contexts.

The SLR design was selected to ensure a rigorous, transparent, and replicable procedure for identifying, evaluating, and integrating existing empirical evidence, while minimizing selection bias and strengthening analytical credibility (Pati & Lorusso, 2018; Mahmud et al., 2024). This approach is particularly appropriate for consolidating fragmented findings across diverse educational settings and methodological traditions.

The literature search was conducted across four academic databases—Google Scholar, Scopus, ScienceDirect, and Elicit.ai—to ensure comprehensive coverage of both national and international peer-reviewed publications in education, religious studies, and the social sciences. The search focused on studies published between 2016 and 2025, a period corresponding with the formal institutionalization and expansion of religious moderation discourse within Indonesian educational policy and scholarly debate.

Search terms were formulated in English to align with international indexing standards and included combinations of “religious moderation,” “religious moderation education,” “elementary education,” “primary school,” “Madrasah Ibtidaiyah,” “curriculum,” “textbook,” “teacher,” and “Indonesia.” Although English keywords were applied, a substantial proportion of the retrieved studies were published in Bahasa Indonesia, reflecting the nationally grounded nature of research on religious moderation in elementary education.

Inclusion criteria were defined to ensure relevance and methodological consistency. Eligible studies were empirical research articles published in peer-reviewed journals that explicitly examined religious moderation or closely related constructs—such as tolerance, inclusivity, and non-violence—within Indonesian SD/MI settings. These included studies addressing curriculum design, textbook content, teacher practices, school culture, or learning activities at the elementary level. Studies focusing exclusively on secondary or higher education, conceptual or opinion-based articles without empirical data, and publications lacking direct relevance to primary education practice were excluded.

The selection process followed a two-stage screening procedure. First, titles and abstracts were reviewed to assess thematic relevance. Second, full-text articles were examined to confirm alignment with the research focus and to ensure methodological eligibility. Through this systematic process, 19 articles were identified and retained for final analysis, consistent with the number reported in the abstract.

From each selected article, data were extracted using a standardized framework that included authorship, year of publication, research context, methodological approach, analytical focus, and key findings. To maintain analytical coherence and facilitate synthesis, extracted data were organized thematically in accordance with three analytical dimensions: conceptualization of religious moderation in curricula and textbooks, implementation strategies and pedagogical models, and reported challenges, constraints, and educational impacts at the SD/MI level.

Data analysis was conducted using a qualitative integrative synthesis approach. This involved a thematic examination of recurring patterns, dominant practices, and contextual variations across the selected studies. Findings were grouped into conceptual, pedagogical, and institutional categories to enable cross-study comparison and to highlight convergences and divergences in implementation. The synthesis remained descriptive and evidence-based, emphasizing consolidation and interpretation of reported findings rather than the development of new theoretical propositions.

This study relied exclusively on secondary data derived from published academic sources and did not involve human participants or primary data collection. Consequently, no formal ethical clearance was required. Nevertheless, the review process adhered to principles of academic integrity, transparency, and ethical scholarship, with all sources cited appropriately and analytical procedures documented clearly to support replicability.

C. Results and Discussion

This section reports empirical findings synthesized from 19 core articles published between 2019 and 2025 that explicitly examine religious moderation education at the elementary school and *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* (SD/MI) level in Indonesia. As summarized in Table 1, the selected studies encompass textbook analyses, teacher-based field research, comparative studies, and pedagogical models projected for primary education contexts.

1. Results

This section presents the empirical findings of the systematic literature review in a descriptive and evidence-based manner. The results are organized according to three analytical dimensions that reflect the dominant patterns emerging from the reviewed studies, namely: (1) conceptualization of religious moderation in curricula

and textbooks, (2) implementation strategies and pedagogical models, and (3) challenges, constraints, and reported educational impacts. This organization follows a predefined analytical framework during data extraction and synthesis, ensuring coherence between the methodological design and the presentation of findings.

Table 1. Core empirical studies on religious moderation education in Indonesian SD/MI (2019–2025)

No.	Author & Year	Article Title	Journal Name / Publisher	Focus & Key Findings	RQ
1.	Priatmo ko, 2019	<i>The Internalization of Wasathiyah Values in Inclusion Madrasah: A Case Study of Integrated Madrasah Ibtida'iyah of Ar-Roihan Malang</i>	AL-BIDAYAH: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Islam / UIN Sunan Kalijaga	Internalizing moderate values in inclusive schools through intra-curricular, extra-curricular, and school habituation (<i>hidden curriculum</i>).	1, 2
2.	Mulyana, 2023	<i>Religious Moderation in Islamic Religious Education Textbook and Implementation in Indonesia</i>	HTS Teologiese Studies / AOSIS Publishing	Analysis of tolerance and justice values in Islamic Education (PAI) textbooks and their implementation in schools in Bandung.	1, 2
3.	Hanik & Agustin, 2023	<i>Study Analysis of The Implementation of Socio-Cultural Literacy in Forming the Character of Religious Moderation in the Merdeka Curriculum for Madrasah Ibtidaiyah</i>	SICEE / IAIN Syekh Nurjati Cirebon	Implementation of socio-cultural literacy in the <i>Merdeka Curriculum</i> as a means to form the moderate character of <i>Madrasah</i> students.	2, 3
4.	Mustafida et al., 2023	<i>Development of School Culture Based on Islamic Moderation Value in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah</i>	SICEE / IAIN Syekh Nurjati Cirebon	Development of school culture that respects ethnic and racial diversity at MIN 1 Malang City.	2
5.	Sadiyah et al., 2024	<i>Global Diversity Values in Indonesia: An Elementary School High-Grade Indonesian Language Textbook Analysis</i>	Int. Electronic Journal of Elementary Education/ IEJEE	Content analysis of global diversity and inclusivity values in Indonesian language textbooks for grades IV-VI.	1
6.	Subair et al., 2024	<i>Multilingualism, Technology, and Religious Moderation in Indonesian Islamic</i>	Int. Journal of Language Education/ Universitas Negeri	The influence of multilingualism and technology in <i>pesantren</i> (boarding schools) on the formation in moderate	2

No.	Author & Year	Article Title	Journal Name / Publisher	Focus & Key Findings	RQ
		<i>Boarding Schools</i>	Makassar	attitudes adaptable to MI levels.	
7.	Maárif et al., 2024	<i>Al-Quran Literacy on Religious Moderation: Critical Communicative Action Research in IRE Learning in the Digital Era</i>	Journal of Ecohumanism/ Transnational Press London	Innovation in digital Al-Quran literacy to strengthen moderate religious understanding and counter intolerant content.	2
8.	Muslih et al., 2024	<i>Religious Moderation in Primary Education: Experiences of Teachers in Indonesia and Malaysia</i>	Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam/ UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta	Comparative study of elementary school teachers' perceptions in Indonesia and Malaysia in delivering moderation messages.	2, 3
9.	Muslih, Luthfan, et al., 2024	<i>The Engagement of Islamic Religious Education Teachers of Primary Schools in Semarang in Instilling Religious Moderation</i>	JIEED / UIN Walisongo Semarang	Exploring the commitment of PAI teachers in Semarang and the obstacles regarding non-comprehensive conceptual understanding.	2, 3
10.	Arif & Chapak iya, 2024	<i>Religious (Islamic) Character Education Based on Local Wisdom: Systematic Study 2014-2024</i>	At-Thullab / Institut Al Azhar Menganti Gresik	Synthesis of local wisdom models (such as <i>Sipakatau</i>) in strengthening religious character from an early age.	1, 2
11.	Azizi & Masitoh, 2024	<i>Innovative Learning Planning in the Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Project in Islamic Religious Education</i>	TARSIYATUSS IBYAN / UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang	Innovation in planning the Pancasila Student Profile Project (P5) to improve character education effectiveness.	2
12.	Sutrisno et al., 2025	<i>Exploring Elementary School Learning Models in Madura in Fostering Religious Moderation Literacy and Emotional Maturity</i>	MADRASAH / UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang	Using the Contextual Teaching and Learning (CTL) model based on Madurese local wisdom in moderation literacy.	1, 2
13.	Baeti et al., 2025	<i>Integration of Religious Moderation Values in Pancasila Education Learning at Hj. Isriati</i>	IJETE / Journal Center	Specific strategies for integrating moderation values into the	2

No.	Author & Year	Article Title	Journal Name / Publisher	Focus & Key Findings	RQ
		<i>Baiturrahman Elementary School Semarang</i>	2	Pancasila Education subject.	
14.	Srinio et al., 2025	<i>Innovation in Learning at Madrasah Ibtidaiyah: Integrating Islamic Values Amidst Tradition and Secular Modernity Debate</i>	Attadrib / UIN Sunan Ampel & International Partners	Analysis of the challenges of integrating moderate Islamic values amidst the pressure of global educational standards.	1, 3
15.	Zuhri, 2025	<i>Improving the Quality of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Through a Religious Moderation Approach</i>	International Journal of Teaching/ Center of Computing and Gender	Positioning religious moderation as a foundational strategy to improve the quality and competitiveness of <i>Madrasahs</i> .	2
16.	Faridah et al., 2025	<i>Instilling the Values of Religious Moderation Through Local Culture in Elementary School Students</i>	JMIE/ UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang	Internalizing values through cross-faith art collaborations and extracurricular activities at SDN 1 Balun.	2
17.	Rudianto et al., 2025	<i>Strengthening Religious Moderation Attitudes Through Multicultural Problem-Based Learning in SD/MI</i>	Proceeding #MUKERNAS 11/ Uniska MAB Banjarmasin	The effectiveness of the Multicultural-based Problem Based Learning (PBL) model in changing student attitudes.	2, 3
18.	Amalia & Susanti, 2025	<i>Integrated Islamic Elementary School Uses Spiritually Charged Reading-Writing Resources for English Learning</i>	PANYONARA / UIN Sunan Kudus	Using English materials with spiritual nuances as a medium for moderate character education in SDIT.	1, 2
19.	Silvi et al., 2025	<i>Implementation of Islamic Religious Learning Models to Foster Environmental Character in a Nature-based Elementary School</i>	SITTAH / IAIN Kediri	Implementation of nature-based PAI learning models to foster care for the environment and others.	2, 3

a. Conceptualization of religious moderation in curricula and textbooks (RQ1)

Findings related to RQ1 demonstrate that religious moderation at the elementary education level is predominantly conceptualized through the integration of normative values within curricula and textbooks rather than through explicit doctrinal or theoretical formulations. Across empirical studies published between 2019 and 2025, moderation is rarely introduced to elementary students as an abstract concept. Instead, it is operationally framed as balanced behavior (*wasathiyah*) and harmonious living, deliberately adjusted to students' cognitive, moral, and socio-emotional development.

The reviewed literature reveals a consistent pattern in which religious moderation is simplified into three functional conceptualizations. First, moderation is positioned as a character disposition. In Islamic Religious Education (PAI) textbooks, moderation is articulated through ethical practices such as justice (*'adl*) and tolerance (*tasamuh*), which are embedded in everyday learning scenarios rather than framed as theological debates (Mulyana, 2023). In this form, moderation functions as a guide for interpersonal conduct, emphasizing fairness, empathy, and respect for differences among peers.

Second, moderation is conceptualized as global citizenship competence. In non-religious subjects, particularly Indonesian language textbooks for upper elementary grades (IV–VI), moderation values are implicitly conveyed through themes of global diversity, inclusivity, intercultural communication, and mutual respect (Sadiyah et al., 2024). Here, moderation extends beyond religious instruction and is framed as a civic orientation required for participation in pluralistic societies.

Third, moderation is framed as an inclusive orientation, particularly within inclusive *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* contexts. Studies conducted in inclusive *madrasahs* highlight how moderation is expanded to include fairness toward students with special needs, thereby positioning moderation as an ethical stance that actively rejects discrimination and exclusion (Priatmoko, 2019).

In terms of conceptual delivery, three dominant frameworks emerge across the corpus. Thematic integration embeds moderation values within language literacy and religious narratives without introducing a new subject structure (Amalia & Susanti, 2025). A local wisdom-based conceptualization situates moderation within indigenous cultural values—such as *sipakatau* in Sulawesi or *maja labo dahu* in Bima—thereby grounding it in students' lived cultural experiences (Arif & Chapakiya, 2024; Sutrisno et al., 2025). Additionally, a synthesis of tradition and modernity is evident in studies

describing how *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* negotiate traditional spiritual values alongside global educational standards and international academic expectations (Srinio et al., 2025).

Overall, the findings indicate that although no standardized or formal definition of religious moderation is explicitly taught at the SD/MI level, there is a consistent functional consensus across studies. Religious moderation is understood as the practice of balance, inclusivity, and respect for diversity, articulated through ethical behavior, local-national identity, and everyday social interaction rather than abstract doctrinal instruction.

b. Implementation strategies and pedagogical models (RQ2)

Evidence addressing RQ2 shows that religious moderation is implemented through interconnected strategies operating across instructional, institutional, and environmental levels.

At the instructional level, Contextual Teaching and Learning (CTL) and multicultural Problem-Based Learning (PBL) emerge as the most frequently reported pedagogical models. CTL grounded in local cultural contexts enables students to relate moderation values to everyday social interactions and lived experiences, thereby strengthening contextual understanding (Sutrisno et al., 2025). Multicultural PBL, in contrast, engages learners in collaborative problem-solving activities centered on diversity, coexistence, and social responsibility, with empirical evidence indicating positive effects on student engagement and attitudinal change (Rudianto et al., 2025).

Complementary instructional strategies include literacy-based and technology-mediated approaches. Digital Al-Qur'an literacy initiatives are used to strengthen moderate religious understanding while countering intolerant digital content (Maárif et al., 2024). Similarly, spiritually nuanced English reading and writing materials are employed to integrate moderation values into foreign language learning in Islamic elementary schools (Amalia & Susanti, 2025).

At the institutional level, school culture is identified as a central mechanism for the internalization of values. Studies conducted in inclusive *madrasahs* emphasize the role of habituation practices, informal interactions, and the operation of a "hidden curriculum" through daily routines, religious activities, and interpersonal norms (Priatmoko, 2019; Mustafida et al., 2023). Extracurricular programs, including interfaith art collaborations and community-based cultural activities, are also reported as effective channels for fostering moderation among elementary students (Faridah et al., 2025).

Several studies further highlight project-based and environmental learning initiatives. Nature-based educational models extend moderation education beyond interpersonal relations to include environmental ethics and shared responsibility for creation (Silvi et al., 2025). Within the Merdeka Curriculum framework, the Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Project (P5) is identified as a formal policy instrument through which moderation values are systematically integrated into school planning and instructional practice (Azizi & Masitoh, 2024).

c. Challenges, Constraints, and Reported Impacts (RQ3)

Findings related to RQ3 reveal a combination of persistent implementation challenges and emerging evidence of educational impact. A recurrent constraint concerns teacher competency and conceptual clarity. Multiple studies report that Islamic Religious Education teachers often possess fragmented or surface-level understandings of religious moderation, resulting in inconsistent classroom practices and a tendency to rely on moral exhortation rather than structured pedagogical design (Muslih et al., 2024). Additional challenges arise from external pressures, particularly tensions between preserving traditional moderation values and meeting globalized academic performance standards (Srinio et al., 2025). Social media exposure and peer environments are also identified as contextual factors that complicate the internalization of values among elementary students (Hanik & Agustin, 2023).

Despite these challenges, several studies document measurable positive impacts. Quantitative evidence indicates that multicultural PBL significantly improves students' attitudes toward diversity, tolerance, and social inclusion (Rudianto et al., 2025). At the institutional level, moderation-oriented educational approaches are associated with improvements in school climate, teacher professionalism, and perceived educational quality, thereby enhancing competitiveness and public trust in *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* (Zuhri, 2025).

To consolidate the patterns identified across the three analytical dimensions (RQ1-RQ3), Table 2 summarizes the dominant empirical findings of the reviewed studies. This synthesis provides an integrated overview of how religious moderation is conceptualized, implemented, and constrained at the SD/MI level, serving as a descriptive reference for the subsequent interpretive discussion.



Table 2. Summary of key findings on religious moderation education in SD/MI

Analytical Dimension	Dominant Findings
Conceptualization (RQ1)	Moderation is embedded implicitly through values of justice, tolerance, inclusivity, and harmony, rather than explicit doctrinal instruction
Pedagogical Implementation (RQ2)	Contextual learning, habituation, teacher modeling, local wisdom-based and culture-responsive approaches
Institutional Mechanism	School culture, religious routines, extracurricular and community-based activities as hidden curriculum
Challenges (RQ3)	Teacher conceptual gaps, digital influence, and misalignment between school and family environments
Reported Impacts	Improved student attitudes, religious habits, and inclusive school climate

Overall, the synthesis presented in Table 2 indicates a consistent pattern across the reviewed studies. Religious moderation education at the SD/MI level is predominantly conceptualized as an implicit set of ethical values embedded within curricula and learning materials, implemented through contextual pedagogy, habituation, and school culture, and shaped by institutional and environmental conditions. Across the corpus, challenges related to teacher conceptual understanding, external influences, and structural alignment are recurrent, while reported impacts generally point to improvements in student attitudes, religious habits, and school climate. This pattern reflects a convergence of empirical findings rather than isolated practices.

2. Discussion

This discussion interprets the synthesized findings of the systematic review by situating them within broader theoretical, pedagogical, and socio-cultural debates on religious moderation and character education. Rather than reiterating empirical results, this section advances an analytical reading that clarifies meaning, significance, and contribution, while explicitly positioning the study within existing scholarship. The discussion is structured around six interconnected dimensions: interpretive synthesis of key patterns, contextual reading of moderation in Indonesian primary education, theoretical positioning, articulation of novelty, global contribution, and research limitations with future directions.

A central interpretive insight emerging from this review is that religious moderation education at the SD/MI level in Indonesia is not constructed as an explicit curricular domain, but as an embedded pedagogical orientation operating across

subjects, routines, and school culture. This pattern reflects a distinctive Indonesian articulation of religious moderation (*al-wasathiyah*), which prioritizes balance, justice, and social harmony over rigid doctrinal formalism (Ridwan et al., 2022; Ma'arif et al., 2023; Lubis et al., 2023). Moderation, in this sense, is not taught as a theological abstraction but lived as an ethical disposition shaped through daily educational practices. Such an orientation underscores that, at the primary level, moral and religious learning is fundamentally experiential rather than discursive.

In relation to the conceptual dimension (RQ1), the findings suggest that moderation values—such as justice (*'adl*), tolerance (*tasamuh*), inclusivity, mutual respect, and peaceful coexistence—are translated into age-appropriate moral conduct rather than abstract religious doctrine (Azizah et al., 2023; Solomon & Klerk, 2023). This translation resonates strongly with Islamic educational thought grounded in the principle of *al-wasathiyah*, which is closely associated with *tawassuth* (the middle path), *i'tidal* (justice), and *tawazun* (balance), as articulated in QS. Al-Baqarah: 143 and elaborated by contemporary Indonesian scholars (Nurdin, 2021; Ulinuha & Nafisah, 2020). At the SD/MI level, moderation thus becomes an ethical grammar embedded in classroom interaction, peer relations, and school life, rather than a contested theological discourse. This finding is significant because it demonstrates how normative religious values are pedagogically reframed to align with children's developmental stages without losing their moral substance.

From a pedagogical perspective (RQ2), the review highlights the central role of teachers as interpretive mediators, translating national policy discourse on religious moderation into concrete educational experiences. Moderation is enacted through contextual teaching, habituation, modeling, project-based learning, extracurricular activities, and instruction grounded in local wisdom. This pattern reflects a broader Indonesian Islamic intellectual tradition in which moderation is understood as lived pluralism and substantive religiosity rather than formalistic compliance. Figures such as Abdurrahman Wahid (Gus Dur) and Ahmad Syafi'i Maarif consistently emphasized moderation as openness, inclusivity, and ethical engagement with diversity (Nurhidayah et al., 2022; Saputra et al., 2021). The pedagogical practices identified in this review echo these intellectual legacies by embedding moderation within everyday educational interactions rather than isolating it as ideological instruction (Muhtar, 2023; Nasution et al., 2024).

At the institutional level, the prominence of school culture and hidden curriculum as mechanisms of value internalization is particularly noteworthy. Religious routines, daily habituation, informal interactions, and community-based activities function as powerful formative forces shaping students' moral dispositions. This pattern aligns with the historical role of pesantren culture, Wali Songo traditions, and mass Islamic organizations such as Nahdlatul Ulama and Muhammadiyah in cultivating moderate religious identities through practice rather than prescription (Azra, 2017; Inayatillah et al., 2022). Within SD/MI contexts, these cultural mechanisms operate implicitly, reinforcing moderation through repetition, exemplarity, and social norms rather than explicit instruction.

However, the review also reveals structural vulnerabilities in the implementation of moderation education (RQ3). A recurring challenge is limited conceptual clarity among teachers, which can lead in inconsistent practices and a reliance on moral exhortation rather than pedagogically structured approaches (Muslih et al., 2024; Nurwahyuni & Tabrani ZA, 2025). This challenge is compounded by external influences, including misalignment between school values and family environments, tensions between traditional religious values and globalized academic performance standards, and the pervasive influence of unfiltered digital content on children (Hanik & Agustin, 2023; Srinio et al., 2025). These constraints mirror broader structural issues identified in national policy evaluations of the implementation of religious moderation (Kemenag, 2019; Muhtar, 2023; Yunita et al., 2025), suggesting that moderation education cannot be sustained solely at the classroom level without systemic support.

Despite these constraints, the documented impacts of moderation-oriented education are pedagogically and socially significant. Improvements in student attitudes toward diversity, strengthened religious habits, and the development of more inclusive and harmonious school climates correspond closely with the core indicators of religious moderation promoted by the Ministry of Religious Affairs – namely, national commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and acceptance of local culture (Ridwan et al., 2022; Kemenag, 2019). Importantly, these impacts emerge not from isolated interventions, but from sustained, integrative educational practices embedded within school life.

The patterns identified in this review align closely with established theories of character education and moral development. Classical frameworks emphasize habituation, role modeling, and contextual learning as foundational mechanisms for value internalization (Lickona, 1992; Nucci, 2019; Rosmawati, 2025). The prominence

of daily routines, teacher exemplarity, and school culture in moderation education reflects the sociocultural assumption that moral learning is constructed through lived experience rather than transmitted through abstract instruction, a view that resonates with contemporary discussions on contextualized and practice-based learning in Indonesian education (Nurulsari et al., 2023; Mujakir et al., 2024). In this sense, moderation education at the SD/MI level exemplifies a sociocultural model of moral formation rather than a cognitive-instructional one.

Pedagogically, the use of Contextual Teaching and Learning, Problem-Based Learning, and local wisdom-based approaches reflects constructivist learning principles that position moderation as a socially negotiated and culturally situated practice (Vygotsky, 1978; Kolb, 2015). The integration of indigenous traditions—such as *Sipakataui*, *Maja Labo Dahu*, and *Adat Basandi Syarak*—demonstrates how cultural identity functions as a mediating structure in moral education, resonating with Stuart Hall’s conception of identity as socially constructed and continuously negotiated. Nevertheless, the limited documentation of longitudinal outcomes and evaluative mechanisms highlights a persistent gap between the theoretical promise of these frameworks and their empirical substantiation at the elementary level.

The central novelty of this study lies in conceptualizing religious moderation education at the SD/MI level as embedded moderation pedagogy—an implicit, integrative, and context-dependent educational practice rather than an explicit curricular field. Unlike prior studies that focus predominantly on secondary or higher education, this review demonstrates that at the primary level: (1) moderation values are diffused across subjects and school culture rather than formal curriculum design; (2) teachers function as interpretive agents who mediate national moderation discourse into developmentally appropriate practices; and (3) a structural discontinuity exists between early moral exposure and systematic reinforcement across educational stages. By consolidating fragmented empirical findings into a coherent conceptual framework, this study clarifies a pattern observed but not explicitly theorized in previous literature.

Beyond the Indonesian context, this study contributes to international debates on religious education, pluralism, and character education in multicultural societies. The findings support global scholarship suggesting that ethical and religious moderation in primary education is most effectively cultivated when framed as a cross-curricular orientation rather than doctrinal instruction (Miedema, 2020; Sharma, 2023;

Al Faqih et al., 2023; Auh & Kim, 2024). Conceptually, embedded moderation pedagogy offers a transferable analytical lens for examining how religious and ethical moderation can be nurtured in early schooling across diverse socio-cultural contexts, particularly in societies facing early ideological exposure and intensified digital influence.

Finally, this study is subject to several limitations that should be acknowledged. First, the body of literature reviewed is dominated by qualitative and descriptive research designs, which limits the ability to draw causal inferences or to assess the effectiveness of religious moderation education through systematic outcome measurement. Second, the absence of longitudinal studies restricts a deeper understanding of how moderation values are sustained, transformed, or diminished across different stages of formal education. Third, although teacher competence and parental influence are repeatedly identified as critical factors in the internalization of moderation values, these dimensions are often addressed implicitly rather than examined as primary analytical foci. Lastly, the limited availability of comparative international studies at the primary education level constrains broader generalization and cross-cultural interpretation of the findings. These limitations highlight structural gaps in the existing literature and delineate the boundaries within which this review's conclusions should be interpreted.

D. Conclusion

This systematic literature review confirms that religious moderation education in Indonesian elementary schools and *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* (SD/MI) is predominantly enacted through integrative and implicit educational practices rather than through a standalone curricular structure. Moderation values are embedded across curricula, textbooks, pedagogical approaches, and school culture, with teachers playing a central role as mediators who translate policy discourse and religious ideals into developmentally appropriate practices. At the primary level, moderation is realized as ethical behavior and social practice, reflecting the pedagogical logic of early moral formation rather than abstract theological instruction.

The synthesis of empirical evidence indicates that a moderation-oriented education has contributed to positive educational outcomes, including more inclusive school climates, improved attitudes toward diversity, and strengthened religious habits. However, implementation remains uneven and is shaped by several structural

constraints, particularly limited teacher conceptual clarity, competing academic priorities, and the growing influence of digital environments on children's value formation. These findings emphasize that moderation education should be understood as a dynamic and context-dependent process mediated by institutional culture, teacher agency, and broader socio-cultural conditions.

The key contribution of this study lies in articulating embedded moderation pedagogy as a unifying analytical framework for understanding religious moderation education at the primary level. This framework clarifies that moderation functions as a cross-curricular ethical orientation sustained through daily learning practices, habituation, and school culture, rather than through explicit doctrinal transmission. By consolidating fragmented empirical studies, this review strengthens the theoretical positioning of moderation education in early schooling, an area that has received limited systematic attention in prior scholarship.

Future research should focus on developing developmentally sequenced moderation frameworks, employing longitudinal and mixed-method approaches to assess long-term educational outcomes, and strengthening teacher professional development and family involvement. Comparative studies across cultural and educational contexts are also essential to extend the global relevance of moderation pedagogy.

Overall, religious moderation education at the SD/MI level is most effective when embedded in everyday learning and school life. This review provides a concise conceptual foundation to inform future research, policy development, and educational practice in religious and character education within pluralistic societies.

Acknowledgments

The authors express their gratitude to the Lecturer of Scientific Article Writing, Prof. Dr. Yoppy Wahyu Purnomo, S.Pd., M.Pd., and also to colleagues in the Odd Semester of the Elementary Education Study Program, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, for their discussions in completing this article.

Declaration of Competing Interest

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest regarding the publication of this article. The research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.



Declaration of Generative AI

The authors declare that artificial intelligence (AI) tools were used solely to assist in language refinement, grammar checking, and stylistic improvement during the manuscript preparation process. The use of AI did not influence the research design, data collection, data analysis, interpretation of findings, or the formulation of scholarly arguments. All substantive content, analytical decisions, and conclusions presented in this article remain the full responsibility of the authors.

Bibliography

- Al Faqih, M. V., Widiarni, A., Andini, N., Saregar, A., Sharov, S., & Faraj, B. M. (2023). Fisikawaii Adventure: An Effort to Increase Students' Learning Participation through Gamification and Virtual Reality. *Online Learning In Educational Research (OLER)*, 3(2), 95-116. <https://doi.org/10.58524/oler.v3i2.294>
- Amalia, T. Z., & Susanti, R. D. (2025). Integrated Islamic Elementary School Uses Spiritually Charged Reading-Writing Resources For English Language Learning. *PANYONARA: Journal of English Education*, 7(2), 427-459. <https://doi.org/10.19105/panyonara.v7i2.19295>
- Amri, Y., Febriandi, Y., & Da-Oh, P. (2024). Religious Moderation Unveiled: The Intersection of Textual and Contextual Approaches to Understanding Indonesian Muslims. *MIQOT: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman*, 48(1), 105-125. <https://doi.org/10.30821/miqot.v48i1.1207>
- Arif, M., & Chapakiya, S. (2024). Religious (Islamic) Character Education Based on Local Wisdom: Systematic Study 2014-2024 Muhamad. *At-Thullab: Journal of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Teacher Education*, 8(2), 242-264. <https://doi.org/10.30736/atl.v8i2.2312>
- Auh, Y., & Kim, C. (2024). Global Citizenship Education: Towards a Critical Moral Pedagogy. *Social Education Research*, 5(2), 450-471. <https://doi.org/10.37256/ser.5220244897>
- Azizah, N., Nurdianzah, E., Wijaya, M. M., Azami, T., & Anas Rohman. (2023). Religious Moderation in The Industrial Era 4.0: Deradicalization Through The Development of Intellectual Traditions at Fadhlul Fadhlan Islamic Boarding School Semarang. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 20(2), 233-246. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.v20i2.7771>
- Azizi, A. N., & Masitoh, D. (2024). Innovative Learning Planning in the Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Project in Islamic Religious Education in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah and Elementary Schools. *TARSIB: Jurnal Program Studi PGMI*, 2(1), 28-37. <https://doi.org/10.61181/tarsib.v2i1.459>

- Azra, A. (2017). Islam Indonesia Inklusif vs Eksklusif: Dinamika Keberagaman Umat Muslimin. *Makalah Untuk Pengajian Ramadhan PP Muhammadiyah*. <https://umj.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/Islam-Indonesia-Inklusif-vs-Eksklusif-Azyumardi-Azra-CBE.pdf>
- Baeti, M. I. N., Harefa, S., Jazila, U., Fatah, N. A., Efendi, A. W., & Chamami, N. R. (2025). Integration of Religious Moderation Values in Pancasila Education Learning at Hj. Isriati Baiturrahman 2 Elementary School Semarang. *Indonesian Journal of Elementary Education (IJETE)*, 1(2), 137-145. <https://doi.org/10.62567/ijete.v1i2.1755>
- Biesta, G. J. (2015). *Good Education in an Age of Measurement: Ethics, Politics, Democracy*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315634319>
- Burhanuddin, N., & Khairuddin, K. (2022). The Radicalism Prevention through Academic Policies at State Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia. *Ulumuna*, 26(2), 363-391. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ujs.v26i2.511>
- Fadil, Marwinata, P., Jannah, S., & Siroj, A. M. (2024). Religious Moderation and Family Resilience in the City of Malang, Indonesia: The Historical Perspectives of the Islamic Law. *Samarah*, 8(1), 236-256. <https://doi.org/10.22373/sjhc.v8i1.19821>
- Faridah, S., Rahman, S. A., Putri, M., Majidah, S. M., & Nulinnaja, R. (2025). Instilling the Values of Religious Moderation through Local Culture in Elementary School. *JMIE: Journal of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Education*, 9(1), 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.32934/jmie.v9i1.655>
- Halstead, J. M., & Taylor, M. J. (2000). Learning and Teaching about Values: A Review of Recent Research. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 30(2), 169-202. <https://doi.org/10.1080/713657146>
- Hanik, E. U., & Agustin, I. N. (2023). Study Analysis of the Implementation of Socio-Cultural Literacy in Forming the Character of Religious Moderation in the Merdeka Curriculum for Madrasah Ibtidaiyah. *Syekh Nurjati International Conference on Elementary Education (SICEE)*, 1, 440-450. <https://doi.org/10.24235/sicee.v1i0.14652>
- Hasan, Moch. S., & Mujahidin, M. (2023). Sufism and Religious Moderation: The Internalization Process in Thoriqoh Syadziliyah Al Masudiyah Jombang. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 6(3), 491-511. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v6i3.4841>
- Inayatillah, I, Kamaruddin, K., & Anzaikhan, M. (2022). The History of Moderate Islam in Indonesia and Its Influence on The Content of National Education. *Journal of Al-Tamaddun*, 17(19), 213-226. <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol17no2.17>

- Kamaludin, F. S., Purnama, T. S., & Zirmansyah, Z. (2021). Religious Moderation Strategy in the Virtual Era and Its Implication to Improving the Quality of Education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(2), 205-216. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v7i2.14944>
- Kemenag. (2019). *Moderasi Beragama*. Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama RI. https://balitbangdiklat.kemenag.go.id/upload/files/MODERASI_BERAGAM_A.pdf
- Kolb, D. A. (2015). *Experiential Learning: Experience as the Source of Learning and Development*. Pearson Education, Incorporated.
- Lickona, T. (1992). *Educating for Character: How Our Schools Can Teach Respect and Responsibility*. Bantam Book.
- Lubis, S., Ependi, R., Tumiran, Harahap, M. Y., & Hakim, A. (2023). The Relevance of Jamal Al-Banna's Islamic Legal thoughts with Religious Moderation in Indonesia. *Al-Istinbath: Jurnal Hukum Islam*, 8(1), 237-252. <https://doi.org/10.29240/jhi.v8i1.6649>
- Ma'arif, S., Ibda, H., Ahmadi, F., Qosim, N., & Muanayah, N. A. (2023). Islamic Moderation in Education and The Phenomenon of Cyberterrorism: A Systematic Literature Review. *Indonesian Journal of Electrical Engineering and Computer Science*, 31(3), 1523-1533. <https://doi.org/10.11591/ijeecs.v31.i3.pp1523-1533>
- Ma'arif, B. S., Rahmat, M., Suryana, E., & Tasmuji. (2024). Al-Quran Literacy on Religious Moderation: Critical Communicative Action Research in IRE Learning in the Digital Era. *Journal of Ecohumanism*, 3(3), 1408-1426. <https://doi.org/10.62754/joe.v3i3.3597>
- Mahmud, S., Musfirah, A. R., Marlina, C. N., Fitria, S., Bujangga, H., Pranajaya, S. A., & Alfiyanto, A. (2024). Integrating Howard Gardner ' s Multiple Intelligences in Islamic Education : A Systematic Review of Indonesian Practices. *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun*, 12(3), 1017-1050. <https://doi.org/10.26811/peuradeun.v12i3.1215>
- Masturin, M. (2023). Development of Islamic Religious Education Materials Based on Religious Moderation in Forming Student Character. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 3(4), 246-355. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v3i4.310>
- Miedema, S. (2020). Religious Education for Plural Societies: The Selected Works of Robert Jackson. *International Journal of Christianity & Education*, 25(1), 121-122. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2056997120960679>
- Mohiyeddini, C. (2024). Cross-Cultural Online Education: Benefits, Challenges, and Solutions. *Online Learning In Educational Research (OLER)*, 4(2), 157-166. <https://doi.org/10.58524/oler.v4i2.456>

- Muhtar, F. (2023). Toward Religious Moderation: Mohammed Arkoun's and Hasan Hanafi's Perspectives on Indonesian Wasatiyah Islam. *MIQOT: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman*, 47(2), 204–221. <https://doi.org/10.30821/miqot.v47i2.1119>
- Mujakir, M., Nurmalahayati, N., Safrijal, S., Salsabil, P., Fatma, E., & Zainuddin, Z. (2024). Efforts to Improve Scientific Literacy Capabilities in Indonesia: Systematic Literature Review. *Online Learning In Educational Research (OLER)*, 4(1), 49–59. <https://doi.org/10.58524/oler.v4i1.395>
- Mulyana, R. (2023). Religious Moderation in Islamic Religious Education Textbook and Implementation in Indonesia. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 79(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v79i1.8592>
- Muslih, M., Luthfan, M. A., Abdullah, R. R., & Setiawan, A. (2024). The Engagement of Islamic Religious Education Teachers of Primary Schools in Semarang in Instilling Religious Moderation. *Journal of Integrated Elementary Education*, 4(2), 189–206. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jieed.v4i2.23080>
- Muslih, M., Muslam, M., Darmi, R., Ramlan, S. R., Abdullah, R. R., & Luthfan, M. A. (2024). Religious Moderation in Primary Education: Experiences of Teachers in Indonesia and Malaysia. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 21(2), 477–491. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.v21i2.10009>
- Mustafida, F., Sulistiono, M., & Gafur, A. (2023). Development Of School Culture Based on Islamic Moderation Value in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah. *Syekh Nurjati International Conference on Elementary Education (SICEE)*, 1, 224–233. <https://doi.org/10.24235/sicee.v1i0.14680>
- Mustakim, Z., Ali, F., & Kamal, R. (2021). Empowering Students as Agents of Religious Moderation in Islamic Higher Education Institutions. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 7(1), 65–76. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v7i1.12333>
- Nasution, S., Asari, H., & Al-Rasyid, H. (2024). Kitab Kuning and Religious Moderation: A Study on State Islamic Universities in Indonesia. *Journal of Al-Tamaddun*, 19(2), 73–88. <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol19no2.5>
- Nucci, L. (2019). Character: A Developmental System. *Child Development Perspectives*, 13(2), 73–78. <https://doi.org/doi.org/10.1111/cdep.12315>
- Nurdin, F. (2021). Moderasi Beragama Menurut Al-qur'an dan Hadist. *Jurnal Ilmiah Al-Mu'ashirah*, 18(1), 59–70. <https://doi.org/10.22373/jim.v18i1.10525>
- Nurhidayah, N., Putra, A., Putra, D. P., Fadhliah, M., & Rosyada, Y. A. (2022). Moderasi Beragama Perspektif Pluralisme Abdurahman Wahid (Gus Dur). *Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 2(2), 360–369. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpiu.v2i2.15577>
- Nurulsari, N., Nisa', K., Viyanti, V., & Yassine, B. (2023). HOTS-Oriented Student Worksheets with Blended Learning: Improving Students' Science Process

- Skills. *Online Learning In Educational Research (OLER)*, 3(1), 47-58. <https://doi.org/10.58524/oler.v3i1.228>
- Nurwahyuni, N., & Tabrani ZA. (2025). Enhancing Teacher Professionalism through the Development of a Positive Self-Concept Based on Communication Psychology. *Jurnal Nispatti*, 10(3), 265-284. <https://doi.org/10.26811/nispatti.v10i3.154>
- Pati, D., & Lorusso, L. N. (2018). How to Write a Systematic Review of the Literature. *Health Environments Research and Design Journal*, 11(1), 15-30. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1937586717747384>
- Priatmoko, S. (2019). The Internalization of Wasathiyah Values in Inclusion Madrasah: A Case Study of- Integrated Madrasah Ibtida'iyah of Ar -Roihan Malang. *Al-Bidayah: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Islam*, 11(2), 358-378. <https://doi.org/10.14421/al-bidayah.v11i2.521>
- Ridwan, A. H., Rahman, M. T., Budiana, Y., Safrudin, I., & Septiadi, M. A. (2022). Implementing and Interpreting Fazlur Rahman's Islamic Moderation Concept in The Indonesian Context. *Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization*, 12(2), 58-73. <https://doi.org/10.32350/jitc.122.05>
- Rifki, M., Ma`arif, M. A., Rahmi, S., & Rokhman, M. (2024). The Principal's Strategy in Implementing the Value of Religious Moderation in the Pancasila Student Profile Strengthening Project. *Munaddhomah*, 5(3), 325-337. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v5i3.1271>
- Rosmawati, W. (2025). Ketergantungan Gadget dan Implikasinya terhadap Interaksi Sosial serta Prestasi Belajar Peserta Didik. *Panteu: Journal of Primary Education and Learning*, 1(1), 19-32. <https://doi.org/10.26811/panteu.v1i1.4>
- Rudianto, A., Maftuh, B., Agustin, M., & Syaodih, E. (2025). Strengthening Religious Moderation Attitudes through Multicultural Problem Based Learning in Elementary/Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Schools. *Proceeding: Islamic University of Kalimantan*. <https://doi.org/10.31602/piuk.v0i0.20966>
- Sadiah, E., Yanti, P. G., & Tarmini, W. (2024). Global Diversity Values in Indonesia: An Elementary School High-Grade Indonesian Language Textbook Analysis. *International Electronic Journal of Elementary Education*, 16(3), 377-390. <https://doi.org/10.26822/iejee.2024.338>
- Saputra, R., Putra, R., & Putri, E. W. (2021). Moderasi Islam Ahmad Syafii Maarif (Kontribusinya Terhadap Pluralitas Agama di Indonesia). *Fikrah*, 9(1), 63-84. <https://doi.org/10.21043/fikrah.v9i1.10305>
- Sharma, N. (2023). Integrating Planetary Citizenship as a Cross-Curricular Theme and a Whole-School Approach: Using a Value-Creating Approach to Learning. *International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning*, 15(1), 14-26. <https://doi.org/10.14324/IJDEGL.15.1.03>

- Sharova, T., Voronov, V., Sharov, S., Kolomoiets, H., & Voronova, A. (2024). Distance Advanced Training of Preschool Teachers in Ukraine: Quantitative Indicators. *Online Learning In Educational Research (OLER)*, 4(1), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.58524/oler.v4i1.343>
- Silvi, E., Arif, M., & Aziz, M. K. N. A. (2025). Implementation of Islamic Religious Learning Models to Foster Environmental Character in a Nature-based Elementary School. *SITTAH: Journal of Primary Education*, 6(2), 97–114. <https://doi.org/10.30762/sittah.v6i2.6192>
- Solomon, H., & Klerk, R. de. (2023). Lessons from the Protestant Reformation for Today's Islamic World. *International Journal of Islamic Khazanah*, 13(2), 109–123. <https://doi.org/10.15575/ijik.v13i2.25503>
- Srinio, F., Sholihah, M., & Sebgag, S. (2025). Innovation in Learning at Madrasah Ibtidaiyah: Integrating Islamic Values Amidst Tradition and Secular Modernity Debate. *Attadrib: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 8(2), 353–368. <https://doi.org/10.54069/attadrib.v8i2.924>
- Subair, M., Syamsurijal, S., Rismawidiawati, R., Idham, I., Muslim, A., & Nur, M. (2024). Multilingualism, Technology, and Religious Moderation in Indonesian Islamic Boarding Schools. *International Journal of Language Education*, 8(3), 550–563. <https://doi.org/10.26858/ijole.v8i3.66498>
- Sutrisno, T., Suprpto, N., Mariana, N., & Widodo, W. (2025). Exploring Elementary School Learning Models in Madura in Fostering Religious Moderation Literacy and Emotional Maturity. *Madrasah: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Dasar*, 18(1), 25–39. <https://ejournal.uin-malang.ac.id/index.php/madrasah/article/view/39133>
- Syahbudin, Z., Ahmad, R. R. M. R., Kasmianti, Zein, N., & Thahir, M. (2023). Developing Students' Religious Moderation Through Group Counseling At Islamic Higher Education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), 15–28. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v0i0.22977>
- Ulinnuha, M., & Nafisah, M. (2020). Moderasi Beragama Perspektif Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy, Hamka, dan Quraish Shihab: Kajian atas Tafsir an-Nur, al-Azhar, dan al-Mishbah. *ŞUHUF: Jurnal Pengkajian Al-Qur'an Dan Budaya*, 13(1), 55–76. <https://doi.org/10.22548/shf.v13i1.519>
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*. Harvard University Press.
- Yunita, W., Rozimela, Y., & Zainil, Y. (2025). Transforming Entrepreneurship Education Through Islamic Values: A Needs Assessment at an Islamic Higher Education Institution in Indonesia. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 8(2), 480–495. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v8i2.224>

- Zamroni, E., Handayani, P. G., Gudnanto, Lestari, I., Azis, A. R., & Kumara, A. R. (2025). Mapping Religious Moderation and Its Impact on Islamic Education in Indonesia: A Bibliometric Approach. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 6(1), 55–81. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v6i1.1487>
- Zuhri, S. (2025). Improving The Quality of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Through Religious Moderation Approach: A Study of Basic Education Literature in Indonesia. *International Journal Teaching*, 2(1), 80–86. <https://doi.org/10.61798/ijt.v2i1.262>